Attachment #12 NPFC/10 #2

CTATE OF ALACKA

JAY S. HAMMOND, GOVERNOR

## DEPARTMENT OF LAW

OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

360 K STREET — SUITE 105 ANCHORAGE 99501

January 25, 1977

Mr. Charles H. Meacham
Director
International Fisheries and
External Affairs
Office of the Governor
Pouch A, State Capitol Building
Juneau, Alaska 99811

Dear Mr. Meacham:

You have requested the opinion of this Department as to whether the 1953 convention for the preservation of halibut between the United States and Canada conforms to the Fishery Conservation and Management Act of 1976 or whether, in the alternative, the convention must be renegotiated pursuant to §202(b) of the Act. For the reasons set out below, it is our view that the convention must be renegotiated.

Section 202(b) of the FCMA provides:

(b) TREATY RENEGOTIATION. -- The Secretary of State, in cooperation with the Secretary, shall initiate, promptly after the date of enactment of this Act, the renegotiation of any treaty which pertains to fishing within the fishery conservation zone \* \* \* and which is in any manner inconsistent with the purposes, policy, or provisions of this Act, in order to conform such treaty to such purposes, policy, and provisions. It is the sense of Congress that the United States shall withdraw from any such treaty, in accordance with its provisions, if such treaty is not renegotiated within a reasonable period of time after such date of enactment. [Emphasis added]

By using the underscored words, it would appear the Congress intended that a treaty be renegotiated unless it strictly conforms to the provisions of the FCMA, including its "purposes" and "policy".

our less) - 11 a ciria 11 - 10 d - 12 de milio Bris aplicio de la confracción del - milio de la circa de la caso 11 d - milio de la caso 12 de la caso 1 - El 1918 - Albania de la caso 12

pursione i : 12 i inc.

eda Array (TOX) alla da (#) I I istikabak

Asset The queences (p.18 or 1900) and the investment of the content of the conten

ikan men akin men kalamin di kalamin di bandan di bandan men di kalamin men di kalamin di kalamin di kalamin d Di kalamin di kalamin di kalamin di kalamin di pakalamin di kalamin di kalamin di kalamin di kalamin di kalami Di kalamin di kalami Mr. Charles H. Meacham January 25, 1977

The following constitutes at least a partial list of the instances in which the convention, in our assessment, is not in accord with the FCMA.

- 1. Article I of the convention contains an express direction that halibut be managed under the principle of maximum sustained yield. In numerous sections of the FCMA (the most applicable of which is § 201(d)), the Congress has directed that fisheries be managed to obtain an optimum yield. The definition of "optimum" in §3(18) of the FCMA indicates that these terms are by no means synonymous.
- 2. The convention sets forth a procedure for the adoption of conservation and management regulations. There is no provision for emergency regulations, however, and we understand that this has led to difficulties in the past. The FCMA does permit the adoption of emergency regulations under §305(e) to respond to a management crisis, and this is generally considered to be an essential administrative option.
- 3. Article III(f) of the convention authorizes regulations fixing the "size and character" of fishing appliances, but does not permit control of the quantity of gear employed by each vessel. Section 303(b)(4) of the FCMA expressly allows this important measure to be implemented. Similarly, the convention makes no provision for limitation of access into the hallbut fishery; this is sanctioned by the FCMA in §303(b)(6).
- 4. The convention operates to permit foreign nationals to engage in fishing for resources which would otherwise be subject to the exclusive fishery management jurisdiction of the United States. The FCMA, in \$201(d), makes available for foreign harvest only that portion of the optimum yield of a resource which is in excess of the needs of US vessels. The current status of halibut stocks adjacent to Alaska would appear to indicate the absence of any such excess.
- 5. While regulations have been adopted under the convention respecting sport fishing, the convention itself is directed at controlling the impact of commercial fishing. The convention does not have as a stated purpose it o promote domestic commercial and recreational fishing as does the FCMA in §2(b)(3). Therefore, the management emphasis of the two is not the same.
- 6. Article II of the convention provides that prosecution and punishment of violators will be undertaken by the country of the offending party. The FCMA permits the United States to take necessary judicial action against a violator regardless of his nationality.
- 7. The stated purposes of the FCMA, which are reinforced by the provisions dealing with the contents of management plans, demonstrate

The fiell mains constitues, at least a partial live of the implement in a partial with a second with

i. Article I of the convention contains an express direction that halther be named the convention of the halther be named and extent of the memorial specifical visit. In express sections of the FUNY (the most applicable of thished visits) is \$201(4)), the Convers has theoded that thishemics he memorial to obtain an orthum viold. The dofinition of "cytimus" in \$2(10) of the FUN indicates that these terms are by no search symmetrees.

i. The convention sets forth a procedure for the adoption of conservation the servation set of provision or provision for charties and provision for charties of the confidence of the set of the confidence of the chartes of the confidence of the chartes of the confidence of chartes of chartes of chartes of chartes of chartes of the confidence of chartes and this is generally considered to be an exemption.

2. Anciole III (1) , i the pervention anthonish repristions the fixing the "size and character" of fixing applituites but for the not pentit control of the quarties of general control of the quarties of general control of the fixed the control of the

4. illa contrançãou e parabas so permit il maiou masimple to an age per in alimentare de antipart de antipart de antipartica d

3. While revolations have been adopted wider the convention wespecting exceptions of convention assembly terditors of a content of the content of the content of content of the content of

6. Abside II. of the servention jermides that project of the projection and punishment by the organizary of the climatic provides the by the organizary of the offending pertor. The FOM percits the the the Entry judical States for the articleson covariless of his nationality.

 $F_{*}$  . Whe rested year rest of the FOMA substituted in the contest of  $F_{*}$  and  $F_{$ 

Mr. Charles H. Meacham January 25, 1977

the high priority placed by Congress on obtaining comprehensive and effective management and protection of valuable living marine resources. For several reasons, the convention does not appear to possess the machinery to meet this management goal. First, the maximum sustained yield directive has contributed at least partially to overfishing of halibut stocks. Second, the convention does not permit control of either directed or incidental fisheries conducted by nonparties which impact halibut stocks. Third, the authority vested in the convention for the high seas fisheries of the North Pacific Ocean pervades that of the halibut convention in the eastern Bering Sea. Fourth, the convention does not mandate comprehensive management plans developed in accordance with specified standards and accompanied by thorough public involvement, as does the FCMA.

8. Finally, by its existence, the convention in effect recognizes traditional fishing rights of Canadians in halibut stocks which would otherwise reside strictly within the jurisdiction and authority of the United States. While the United States would not be prohibited from allocating some halibut to Canada if the necessary prerequisites were met, §201(e) of the FCMA provides that traditional participation in a fishery is only one of four considerations in selecting an allocation scheme.

Sincerely,

AVRUM M. GROSS ATTORNEY GENERAL

By: Jeff Haynes

Assistant Attorney General

nn, Chanles II. Kaachan Vennany 25, 1977 -3-

and high unicater placed by Congress on cheataint occurrationstra and efficacive managinent and charactive and calculative managinent and resources. The several respons, the conversion does not ampean to possers the manimum research to make this isnagement goal. Thret. The to possers the manimum research yield dimeotive has contributed at least partially to oversitating of halibut stocks. Second the convention case not permit convention of distant directed or moderical finisher convention of an inclinatial finisher convention for the high reas first the authority vested in the convention for the high reas first the the the Morth Recition Community, the convention for the high reas first chicked the companient plans developed in adoption of the first convention in the companient plans developed in adoptions, as done the figure and accompanied by themselved in adoptions, as done the figure.

I. Thually, by its emistrace, the ornwention in effect recombine trefitational lights emistrace, the ornwention in editect recome which rould curerwise reside remission the jumis locker and anchors which rould curerwise reside remission the fraction and anchors which of the phates series while the thitted fracted would not be problitical form allocating serie halibut to Canada if the hoosesam prenetalization as include the figure considerations in solecting in allocating and only one of rough considerations in solecting an allocating or

cincomely,

Avrum M. Groce .. Amichiga General