Bering Sea climate-enhanced multi-species stock assessment

Sept., 2023

Kirstin K. Holsman Jim Ianelli, Kerim Aydin, Grant Adams, Kalei Shotwell, Steve Barbeaux, Kelly Kearney <u>https://apps-afsc.fisheries.noaa.gov/Plan_Team/2022/EBSmultispp.pdf</u>



2022 Climate-enhanced multi-species Stock Assessment for walleye pollock, Pacific cod, and arrowtooth flounder in the South Eastern Bering Sea

Kirstin K. Holsman, Jim Ianelli, Kerim Aydin, Grant Adams, Kelly Kearney, Kalei Shotwell, Grant Thompson, and Ingrid Spies

kirstin.holsman@noaa.gov November 2022 Alaska Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, 7600 Sand Point Way N.E., Seattle, Washington 98115

https://apps-afsc.fisheries.noaa.gov/Plan_Team/2022/EBSmultispp.pdf

Two models presented each year:

SSM : without trophic interactions (single-species mode) MSM : with trophic interactions (multi-species mode)

Produced annually 2016 - present



EBS CEATTLE





Holsman; CEATTLE

Incorporating predation interactions in a statistical catch-at-age model for a predator-prey system in the eastern Bering Sea

1865

Jesús Jurado-Molina, Patricia A. Livingston, and James N. Ianelli

Abstract: Virtual population analysis and the statistical catch-at-age methods are common stock assessment models used for management advice. The difference between them is the statistical assumptions allowing the fitting of parameters by considering how errors enter into the models and the data sources for the estimation. Fishery managers are being asked to consider multispecies interactions in their decisions. One option to achieve this goal is the multispecies virtual population analysis (MSVPA); however, its lack of statistical assumptions does not allow the use of tools used in single-species stock assessment. We chose to use a two-species system, walleye pollock (*Theragra chalcogramma*) and Pacific cod (*Gadus macrocephalus*), to incorporate the predation equations from MSVPA into an age-structured multispecies statistical model (MSM). Results suggest that both models produced similar estimates of suitability coefficients and predation mortalities. The adult population estimates from the single-species stock assessment and MSM were also comparable. MSM provides a measure of parameter uncertainty, which is not available with the MSVPA technologies. MSM is an important advancement in providing advice to fisheries managers because it incorporates the standard tools such as Bayesian methods and decision analysis into a multispecies context, helping to establish useful scenarios for management in the Bering Sea.

$\mathsf{MSVPA} \to \mathsf{Statistical} \ \mathsf{MSM}$

Jurado-Molina et al. 2005 doi: 10.1139/F05-110







A comparison of fisheries biological reference points estimated from temperature-specific multi-species and single-species climate-enhanced stock assessment models

Kirstin K. Holsman^{a,*}, James Ianelli^a, Kerim Aydin^a, André E. Punt^b, Elizabeth A. Moffitt^{b,1}

^a Alaska Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, 7600 Sand Point Way N.E., Building 4, Seattle, Washington 98115, USA
^b University of Washington School of Aquatic and Fisheries Sciences, 1122 NE Boat St., Seattle, WA 98105, USA

"CEATTLE"

<u>Climate Enhanced Age-structured</u> model with <u>Temperature-specific</u> <u>Trophic Linkages and Energetics</u>

Holsman et al. 2016

CrossMark







Holsman et al. 2016



Search or jump to...

Rceattle

https://github.com/grantdadams/Rceattle

Fisheries Research 251 (2022) 106303

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect **Fisheries Research**



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/fishres

An ensemble approach to understand predation mortality for groundfish in the Gulf of Alaska



Grant D. Adams^{a,*}, Kirstin K. Holsman^{a,b}, Steven J. Barbeaux^b, Martin W. Dorn^b, James N. Ianelli^b, Ingrid Spies^b, Ian J. Stewart^c, André E. Punt^a

^a School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences, University of Washington, Seattle, WA, USA ^b Resource Ecology and Fisheries Management Division, Alaska Fisheries Science Center, Seattle, WA, USA ^c International Pacific Halibut Commission, Seattle, WA, USA

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Handled by: Mark Nicholas Maunder

Keywords: Stock assessment Ecosystem-based fisheries management Natural mortality Multi-species State-space Climate change

There is increasing consensus of the need for ecosystem-based fisheries management (EBFM), which accounts for trophic interactions and environmental conditions when managing exploited marine resources. Continued development and testing of analytical tools that are expected to address EBFM needs are essential for guiding the management of fisheries resources in achieving and balancing multiple social, economic, and conservation objectives. To address these needs, we present and compare alternative climate-informed multi-species statistical catch-at-age models to account for spatio-temporal differences in stock distributions, with application to four groundfish species (walleve pollock Gadus chalcogrammus, Pacific cod Gadus macrocephalus, arrowtooth flounder Atheresthes stomias, and Pacific halibut Hippoglossus stenolepis) in the Gulf of Alaska, USA. We integrate across 1 11 . . .



Grant Adams

grantdadams

Unfollow

I am a PhD student at the University of Washington School of Aquatic and **Fisheries Science**.

Al 20 followers · 24 following

CEATTLE Applications

- Operational advice:
 - o Appendix to BSAI pollock assessment (2016 to now)
 - o M2 index for EBS ecosystem status report (2016 to now)
 - o M2 index for ESP (2020 to now)
- Research:
 - o 2010-2015 BSIERP MSE
 - o 2016- now ACLIM climate MSE
 - o 2019-2023 Lenfest NFS
 - o Lenfest ocean wealth
- Bering Seasons
 - o Forecasts under 9mo
- GOA
 - o G. Adams (UW) : 3 and 4 species model for GOA (Adams et al, in review)
 - o G. Adams (UW) : M2 index for GOA Ecosystem Status Report (2021-now)
 - o Climate MSE underway for GOA
- Hake (S. Wassermann)



Holsman, K. K. et al. Climate-informed multispecies assessment model methods for determining biological references points and Acceptable Biological Catch. *Protoc. Exch.* In press https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.pex-1084/v1 (2020).



An integrative bioenergetics and spatial approach for quantifying relationships between northern fur seals, their prey, fisheries and climate







a collaboration between the COOPERATIVE INSTITUTE FOR CLIMATE, OCEAN AND ECOSYSTEM STUDIES AT THE UNIVERSITY OF WASHINGTON and the RESOURCE ECOLOGY AND FISHERIES MANAGEMENT AND MARINE MAMMAL LABORATORY AT THE ALASKA FISHERIES SCIENCE CENTER with support from THE LENFEST OCEAN PROGRAM







Ivonne Ortiz UW/CICOES Food-web. ecosystem and fisheries modeling FEAST

Jeremy Sterling MML/AFSC Fur seal ecology

Kerim Avdin REFM/AFSC Resource ecology and ecosystem modeling FEAST



Nick Bond UW/JISAO Variability in climate and atmospheric forcing

Kirstin Holsman REFM/AFSC Climate specific multispecies stock assessments CFATTLF ACLIM

Elizabeth McHuron UW/JISAO Marine mammal bioenergetics and population dynamics modeling





CEATTLE Applications

- Operational advice:
 - o Appendix to BSAI pollock assessment (2016 to now)
 - o M2 index for EBS ecosystem status report (2016 to now)
 - o M2 index for ESP (2020 to now)
- Research:
 - o 2010-2015 BSIERP MSE
 - o 2016- now ACLIM climate MSE
 - o 2019-2023 Lenfest NFS
 - o Lenfest ocean wealth
- Bering Seasons
 - o Forecasts under 9mo
- GOA
 - o G. Adams (UW) : 3 and 4 species model for GOA (Adams et al, in review)
 - o G. Adams (UW) : M2 index for GOA Ecosystem Status Report (2021-now)
 - o Climate MSE underway for GOA
- Hake (S. Wassermann)



Holsman, K. K. et al. Climate-informed multispecies assessment model methods for determining biological references points and Acceptable Biological Catch. *Protoc. Exch.* In press https://doi.org/10.21203/rs.3.pex-1084/v1 (2020).



CEATTLE workflow features



- R and shell scripts used to run the model through projections:
 - Regular output includes ESR contribution (R markdown)
 - ESP indices (produced annually but not yet used)?
 - Assessment written in Rmarkdown using Rdata outputs
- Github repositories (* private)
 - *CEATTLE (ADMB):

https://github.com/kholsman/CEATTLE

• Rceattle (G. Adams; R/TMB):

https://github.com/grantdadams/Rceattle



Model Summary

CEATTLE (Holsman et al. 2016)

- NEBS+EBS
- Age or Length based
- Multi- or single-species
- ADMB
- Climate (energetics) effects on
 - Growth
 - Mortality (if in MSM)
 - Recruitment
- Used to derive climate-inform. ABC
- Pollock, Pcod, ATF
- Operational 2016 now (annually)
- Climate naive targets; climate informed reference points

Rceattle (Adams et al. 2022)

- GOA
- Age or Length based
- Multi- or single-species
- TMB
- Random effects
- Data weighting
- Climate (energetics) effects on
 - Growth*
 - Mortality (if in MSM)
 - Recruitment
- Used in EBS, GOA, and Cali Current (hake)
- Pollock, Pcod, ATF, Halibut, and Hake



Discussion : Climate informed BRPs

Set B0 and B40 target using climate informed models

NO!



Adapting reference points to reflect changes in productivity

- MSA directs reference points to reflect current and probable future environmental conditions
- Changing reference points for stocks undergoing climate-related productivity shifts can result in counter-intuitive management actions:
 - Declining stocks could be fished harder
 - Flourishing stocks could be fished more conservatively



Szuwalski et al. 2023

First: Set Target / reference points

Climate informed B0 / Dynamic B0



Time

First: Set Target / reference points





First: Set Target / reference points





"hybrid" climate- naive & climate informed approach

Climate naive B0 + climate informed By



"hybrid" climate- naive & climate informed approach





Climate informed biological reference points



B) Sloping harvest control rule



Holsman et al. 2020. https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-18300-3

A) Biological reference points



Discussion : Climate informed BRPs





2022 Climate-enhanced multi-species Stock Assessment for walleye pollock, Pacific cod, and arrowtooth flounder in the South Eastern Bering Sea

Kirstin K. Holsman, Jim Ianelli, Kerim Aydin, Grant Adams, Kelly Kearney, Kalei Shotwell, Grant Thompson, and Ingrid Spies

kirstin.holsman@noaa.gov November 2022 Alaska Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, 7600 Sand Point Way N.E., Seattle, Washington 98115



https://data.pmel.noaa.gov/aclim/thredds/catalog/files.html



ROMS output



https://data.pmel.noaa.gov/aclim/las/UI.html

74

Print LAS for ACLIM UPDATE Correlation Viewer Data B10K-H16_CMIP5_CESM_rcp85 B10K-H16_CMIP5_CESM_rcp85 Level 2 (bottom 5m) time-averaged potential temperature, bottom 5m mean V depth at horizontal psi points, w depth 0 0 depth at horizontal rho points, w depth TIME: 22-JAN-2006 12:00 depth at horizontal u points, w depth 0 time-averaged potential temperature, bottom 5m mean (Celsius) 0 depth at horizontal v points, w depth DATASET: B10K-H16_CMIP5_CESM_rcp85 Level 2 (bottom 5m) OPeNDAP URL: https://data.pmel.noaa.gov/aclim/thredds/dodsC/Level2/B10K-H16_CMIP5_CESM_rcp85_bottom5m_collection.nc 0 time-averaged ammonia concentration, bottom LAS 9.7.5/PyFerret 7.64 NOAA/PMEL 5m mean Native Curvilinear Plot time-averaged free-surface 0 time-averaged iron concentration, bottom 5m 0 mean -2.0 -1.0 -0.1 0.1 0.3 0.5 0.7 0.9 1.1 1.3 1.5 1.7 1.9 2.1 2.3 2.5 2.7 2.9 3.5 4.5 time-averaged nitrate concentration, bottom 5m 0 7.82413 -2.22782 mean time-averaged potential temperature, bottom 5m mean 66°N O Vector of depth at horizontal u points, w depth and depth at horizontal v points, w depth 62 °N Axes Selections 58°N **Plot Types** CREASE **Analysis Transformations** 54°N 8

ROMS output

Biomass





Biomass





Biomass





ESP indices



Use this if: need index of plk, pcod, atf eating other prey (eg snow crab)





Biomass (climate projections)





Catch (climate projections)





Climate informed BRPs and ABC evaluations

Probability of near-term (+ 1-2 yr) biomass decline or increase:

- Relative to 2022 levels, the model projects SSB of pollock will increase in 2023 (properties 2022 catch) followed by an increase in SSB in 2024 (projected with F_{ABC}). For Pacific code projects a decline in SSB in both 2023 and 2024.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming spenarios (including high carbon mitigation (ssp126), low carbon mitigation (ssp585), as well as persistence scenarios and assuming 2022 catch for 2023 and F_{ABC} for 2024) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will remain between 125-138% of 2022 SSB in 2023 and will be between 123-134% of 2022 SSB levels in 2024.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that Pacific cod SSB will continue to decline to between 86-99% of 2022 SSB in 2023 and between 73-83% of 2022 SSB levels in 2024.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 92 and 130% of 2022 SSB in 2023 and will be between 87 and 117% of 2022 SSB levels in 2024.



Improve with

ROMS forecasts

Multispecies assessment

vember 2022 Council Draft

EBS Multispecies supplement (CEATTLE)

2022 Climate-enhanced multi-species Stock Assessment for walleye pollock, Pacific cod, and arrowtooth flounder in the South Eastern Bering Sea

Kirstin K. Holsman, Jim Ianelli, Kerim Aydin, Grant Adams, Kelly Kearney, Kalei Shotwell, Grant Thompson, and Ingrid Spies

kirstin.holsman@noaa.gov November 2022 Alaska Fisheries Science Center, National Marine Fisheries Service, NOAA, 7600 Sand Point Way N.E., Seattle, Washington 98115

Summary of assessment results for 2022:

Biomass

- At 6.8 million tons, the 2022 SEBS pollock spawning biomass from the multispecies model is above the long-term (1979-2015) average of 4.9 million tons and represents a 31% change from 2021 and 35% change from 2020 spawning biomass levels. Similarly, the downward trend in total biomass observed in the past few years has continued through 2022, with recent declines placing the total 2022 biomass (23 million 1) above the 1973-2015 average of 15.4 million tons. However it is important to note that because there was no Alaska Fisheries Science Center summer bottom trawl survey in 2020, estimates of, and differences relative to the 2020 biomass should be interpreted cautiously.
- The 2022 SEBS Pacific cod female spawning biomass has declined -10% since 2021 and -26% since 2020.
 2022 estimates are approximately -17% below the 1970-2015 average. Total biomass in the SEBS has declined -45% since 2016, and at approximately 758 thousand tons, is 26% below the long-term 1979-2015 average of 1 million tons. These patterns are driven in part by continued low survey indices in 2021 and warm bottom temperatures that have induced northward redistribution of the P. cod stock (Spice et al. 2020, Stevenson et al. 2019). This assessment does not include Northern Bering Sea survey data collected in 2017, 2018, and 2019.
- Arrowtooth total and spawning biomass estimates are 48% and 65% greater than the long-term 1979-2015 average (respectively), and trends suggest relatively stable biomass since 2012.
- The multispecies model estimates of a 31% and -10% change in spawning biomass (SSB) between 2021 and 2022 for pollock and Pacific cod (respectively) agree with CEATTLE single species model patterns of decline (25% and -10%, respectively). Both models predict an increase (slightly) in spawning biomass for arrowtooth flounder relative to 2021.

Recruitment

 While pollock age 1 recruitment estimates for this year are 35% above the 1979-2015 average, estimated recruitment has decreased (slightly) in 2022 relative to 2021(note that the most recent estimates have the highest uncertainty). Probability of near-term (+ 1-2 yr) biomass decline or increase:

- Relative to 2022 levels, the model projects SSB of pollock will increase in 2023 (projected based on 2022 catch) followed by an increase in SSB in 2024 (projected with F_{ABC}). For Pacific cod the model projects a decline in SSB in both 2023 and 2024.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming scenarios (including high carbon mitigation (ssp126), low carbon mitigation (ssp585), as well as persistence scenarios and assuming 2022 catch for 2023 and F_{ABC} for 2024) estimate a 95% chance that pollock scenarios and scenarios (sp126) and s

Use climate informed model to characterize risk in +1 & +2 years

ojections estif 2022 SSB in

ojections esti-

mate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 92 and 130% of 2022 SSB in 2023 and will be between 87 and 117% of 2022 SSB levels in 2024.

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under high mitigation (low warming) scenarios:

Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management.

· Ensemble projections using climate enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming sce-

Use climate informed model to characterize risk in 10 + years with low warming

will be between 71-75% of 2022

projections estibetween 69-74%

 Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 76-100% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 81-92% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 76-90% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under low carbon mitigation scenarios (high warming):

Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management.

Use climate informed model to characterize risk in 10 + years with high warming

e warming scewill be between between 48 and

projections esti-

FISHERIES

mate a 95% chance that Pacific cod SSB will be between 55 and 90% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 61 and 75% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 36 and 48% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

https://apps-afsc.fisheries.noaa.gov/Plan_Team/2022/EBSmultispp.pdf

Climate informed BRPs and ABC evaluations

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under high mitigation (low warming) scenarios:

Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management.

- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming scenarios and assuming F_{ABC} for 2024 2100) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will be between 69-76% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 73-78% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 71-75% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that Pacific cod SSB will be between 69-78% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 69-74% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 58-64% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 76-100% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 81-92% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 76-90% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under low carbon mitigation scenarios (high warming):

Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management.

- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming scenarios and assuming F_{ABC} for 2024 2100) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will be between 62 and 73% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 65 and 69% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 48 and 53% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that Pacific cod SSB will be between 55 and 90% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 61 and 75% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 36 and 48% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.
- Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 67 and 91% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 63 and 72% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 42 and 50% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

Improve with graphics



Climate informed BRPs and ABC evaluations

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under high mitigation Improve with graphics Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management. · Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming sce-

narios and assuming F_{ABC} for 2024 - 2100) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will be between 60.76% of 2022 SSR in 2022 between 72.78% of 2022 SSR levels in 2050 and between 71.75% of 2022

Probability of long-term (2032, 2050, 2080) biomass decline or increase under high mitigation (low warming) scenarios:

Note that projections assume no adaptation by the species, fishery, or fishery management.

• Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming scenarios and assuming F_{ABC} for 2024 - 2100) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will be between 69-76% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 73-78% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 71-75% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

mitiga Note th

Probal

(low warming) scenarios:

· Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models and projected future warming scenarios and assuming F_{ABC} for 2024 - 2100) estimate a 95% chance that pollock SSB will be between 62 and 73% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 65 and 69% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 48 and 53% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

 Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that Pacific cod SSB will be between 55 and 90% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 61 and 75% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 36 and 48% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.

 Ensemble projections using climate-enhanced recruitment models based on long-term projections estimate a 95% chance that arrowtooth SSB will be between 67 and 91% of 2022 SSB in 2032, between 63 and 72% of 2022 SSB levels in 2050, and between 42 and 50% of 2022 SSB levels in 2080.



Climate impacts on spatial predator-prey interactions in the Eastern Bering Sea

ACLIM Spatial Subgroup October 4th, 2022

https://mgoodman.shinyapps.io/aclim2_sdms_explorer/



Shifting fish distributions drive changes in predation intensity in the Eastern Bering Sea

Gemma Carroll, Steph Brodie, Arnaud Gruss, Jim Thorson, Stan Kotwicki, Kirstin Holsman, Becca Selden, Elliott Hazen



Climate effects on groundfish trophic interactions: scaling from individuals to shelf communities

Jim Thorson

3

Projecting changes in predator-prey overlap and implications for management

Kirstin Holsman, Andre Punt, Cheryl Barnes, John Reum, Maxime Olmos

Slide: Maurice Goodman

Discussion : Climate informed BRPs

- I. Methods to explore for setting climate-informed ABCs
- 2. Feedback on how long-term outlooks are communicated
- 3. Transition to TMB via merging CEATTLE and Rceattle
- 4. NSF conditioned ABC (2024)
- 5. Include ACLIM MSE results and CI features
- 6. Share output via AKFIN
- 7. Push to align more closely with other stocks?

